



The challenges of breeding the best varieties for Regenerative Agriculture Dr Phil Howell, NIAB

What to expect this session

- Phil Howell, NIAB
 - Mainstream breeding, trials and seed marketing
 - Why this may not deliver for Regen Ag
 - Steps in the right direction, and thoughts about the future
- Stephanie Swarbreck, NIAB
 - Nitrogen responsiveness as a trait for sustainable agriculture
- Ambrogio Costanza, ORC
- Questions from the floor and discussion with all speakers



Working back from mainstream markets

- Commercial breeding obviously targets varieties to suit the marketplace
- Seed royalty market is relatively small and very competitive
- Targeting niches is high risk most of the certified area is sown with AHDB RL varieties
- RL criteria therefore shape selection strategies further back in breeding programmes
- If these changed, breeders would adapt and so variety type would change
 - "In principle, the husbandry of the trial should be appropriate to achieve highest quality and yield"
 - "Nitrogen applications should be tailored to give maximum yield within the constraints of obtaining the appropriate grain protein contents for intended use" [AHDB RL protocol]

- Testing in alternative situations (e.g. low-input / direct-drilled / organic trials) often deferred until near to commercial launch, i.e. at end of selection funnel
- Organic growers often favour older varieties, as selected under pre-pesticide inputs

Groundswell

Mainstream breeding

- 'Cross the best with the best and select the best'
- Marker-assisted technologies help with cross design and with early-generation selection
- Accelerated breeding (single-seed descent, doubled-haploids, shuttle breeding) can also help with early generation selection and multiplication
- Field testing often starts with untreated, inoculated nurseries: selection for disease resistance, plant type, yield components
- Yield / agronomic / predictive quality testing come later
- Selection funnel fewer lines tested at each stage, but more widely / thoroughly
- Best lines from a programme enter NL testing, best NL lines across programmes enter RL testing:
 - Each breeder 500-1000 crosses \rightarrow 1-2 million F2 individuals \rightarrow 5-10 NL1 \rightarrow 1-2 RLT \rightarrow 1 successful variety

Breeders' Equation: increasing genetic gain



'Selection intensity': how much better than the wider population are your selections

'genetic variance': how much genetic variation do you have Groundswell

8 world-class experience, skills and resources

Groundswell

Technical limitations

- Large diverse populations screened in accurate, uniform field experiments give best gains
- Regen situations do not always make this easy
- Hard to establish min-till trials and nurseries, so selecting on fundamentally different soils
 - Trials and nursery plots are best drilled into fine tilth (often ploughed and harrowed)
 - Min-till farm drills rely on size & speed, not compatible with drilling small plots
 - Opportunity for engineering solution?
- Reducing inputs is relatively straightforward, but makes trials fundamentally less accurate
 - Soil fertility, weed burden, pest impact likely to be more variable across low-input plots, needing more replication / more locations / smarter trial design
 - If more location/years required to build a robust data set, variety development will slow
- How to select for performance in blends or intercropping?
- How to best integrate with cover crops / undersowing / living mulches / overwinter grazing?

Groundswell

Commercial limitations

- Slower variety development might lead to increased seed prices
- Reduced inputs \rightarrow reduced yield from seed crops \rightarrow increased seed prices
- If RL selection criteria change, 'burn-in' period needed for new traits to filter through
- Or do we need separate "conventional" and "regen" lists? How will this be paid for?
- Would current high certification standards and royalty-based business model need to change?
- Variety blends and populations promise to help risk management and yield stability, but how do they fit with current royalty models?
- Will end-users (and ultimately, consumers) accept potentially lower-spec crops grown under reduced inputs?

Steps in the right direction: research

• The public sector is funding more crop research than 20-30 years ago

• Most of this is targeting the fundamentals of how to reduce inputs

• Much more known about aspects of soil health, roots, microbiome

 DEFRA have an increased research profile, much closer to policy, with several relevant opportunities





ood and Rural Affai



Biotechnology and

Biological Sciences Research Council



Steps in the right direction: research

- "Pre-breeding" research moving from trait discovery in the lab to providing commercial breeders with well-adapted material
- Several BBSRC-funded multi-partner projects since 2010
- Stakeholder involvement, though largely just breeders
- Pest & disease resistance, sustainable yield improvement, improved nutrition
- Now trickling through in breeders' own improved germplasm
- Similar initiatives needed in other crops other cereals and grains, grain legumes, oilseeds, forage and fibre crops
- More support needed for long term experiments and studies







Steps in the right direction: NIAB research

12.5 Grain protein concentration (%) 0.11 0.71 0.71 0.71 0.71 PRO004 PR0057 PR0045 PRO124 . • PRO001 PRO056 SKYFALL CELLULE ROBIGUS 10.5 KWSSANTIAGO 80 85 90 95 75 100 Grain yield

Groundswell

NIAB world-class experience, skills and resources

Steps in the right direction: AHDB response

- Since 2015, RL has raised emphasis on disease resistance relative to treated yield
 - OSR light leaf spot High \rightarrow Very high
 - Winter barley mildew Medium \rightarrow High
 - Winter wheat YR Medium \rightarrow High; mildew Medium \rightarrow High
- 'Special' RL categories to promote rapid uptake of specialist traits
 - First seen with wheat OWBM resistance
 - More recently, OSR TuYV resistance and Clearfield traits
 - Wheat BYDV resistance, winter barley BYDV tolerance
- Wheat Yellow Rust 'watch list' for varieties at higher risk of ratings falling
- Variety blends tool to help growers select suitable varieties to blend
- Evaluating trials to investigate interactions between variety & primary cultivations
- Enhanced digital access to the RL to help farmers access and understand the list, RL App, Variety selection tools



Steps in the right direction: commercial work

- Breeders are actively using pre-breeding material
- Seed companies are tailoring their offers
 - Blends, cover crops, companion crops, specialist crops
- There is no shortage of companies offering biostimulants etc
- Lots of kit and advice is available
- Current prices and costs are making everyone look more closely at their crop inputs (and outputs)

